

NEW WINE IN OLD BOTTLES:  
LEMPRIERE'S CLASSICAL DICTIONARY  
AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF  
SCHOLARLY PUBLISHING IN  
AMERICA—A BIBLIOGRAPHIC ESSAY

BY HENDRIK EDELMAN  
edelman@earthlink.net

### Introduction

When the twenty-three-year-old budding classical scholar, John Lempriere, published his *Classical Dictionary* in 1788, no one, and certainly not the author, could have dreamed that the book would be used and stay in print until today. It did, however, and the story of its origin, impact, and survival for more than two centuries is as unusual as it is enlightening. The book established a reputation for its author, made money for him and his publishers, and allowed several other scholars to prove themselves. On its way, it metamorphosed into several other important publications. And it has even spawned an ambitious and well-received novel.<sup>1</sup>

Meanwhile, the book has instructed scores of generations of classical students in the English-speaking world. Leigh Hunt, John Keats, William Wordsworth, William Morris, Ralph Waldo Emerson, Henry Thoreau, Nathaniel Hawthorne, and Emily Dickinson both used and owned copies,<sup>2</sup> and its many editions continue to adorn the reference and rare-book shelves of a great many libraries worldwide. But the publication history of the book also parallels that of a considerable number of British books that were used in post-revolutionary America as vessels for the introduction of new knowledge and scholarship in the time that the indigenous book industry evolved from a cottage industry to a truly national enterprise.

<http://dx.doi.org/dx.doi.org/10.14713/jrul.v67i0.1896>

*Journal of the Rutgers University Libraries*, Volume 67, pp 56–74.



JRUL is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivs 3.0 United States License

### Lempriere and His Dictionary

John Lempriere was born in 1765 in Jersey, England, in a family with a long and prominent local history. His father Charles sent him in 1779 to Winchester, one of England's finest schools. After completing his studies there in 1784, when he was nineteen, Lempriere, transferred to Pembroke College at Oxford, where he received all his subsequent literary and religious degrees, including a BA in 1790 and a DD in 1803. Pembroke had been the academic home of Samuel Johnson (1709–1784), who may well have served as Lempriere's lexicographic inspiration.

Pembroke was also where Richard Valpy (1754–1836), headmaster at Reading Grammar School for fifty years, had taken his degree. His Latin and Greek grammars were widely used on both sides of the Atlantic Ocean for many generations and several of his students, including his son Abraham, went on to become influential classicists. Valpy, also born in Jersey, became young Lempriere's mentor, appointing him assistant master at that school in 1788. By that time, Lempriere's work on his dictionary was already well on its way.

With a preface dated November 1788, the book was published in the same year with the title: *Bibliotheca Classica; or, a classical dictionary containing a full account of all the proper names mentioned in the antient authors. To which are subjoined, tables of coins, weights, and measures, in use among the Greeks and Romans*. It was printed in an octavo edition measuring 9 inches by 5 inches, with unnumbered pages totaling just over 800. The title page states that the book was printed in Reading, but it is not clear who printed the book and on whose account. A letter from Lempriere to Thomas Cadell, bookseller in the Strand in London, suggests a text for an advertisement, which includes the statement: "sold by T. Cadell, London."<sup>3</sup>

In his preface, Lempriere modestly states that the book is intended for the use of schools and students, but he hopes that "it will not be deemed an useless acquisition in the hands of the public" and that "the man of letters may perhaps find it not a contemptible companion, from which he may receive information, and be made, a second time, acquainted with many important particulars which time, or more laborious occupations may have erased from his memory." He mentions his many sources, which included Latin, English, and French writers and acknowledges the advice from his mentor Richard Valpy. His time span was

ambitious: From the fall of Troy to the fall of Trebizond in 1461, almost the end of the Byzantine Empire.

Sales of the book must have been good, because in 1792 a second "greatly enlarged" edition appeared by Cadell in London. Additions were a chronological table and a list of the current editions of Greek and Latin classics. The author writes in his introduction: "The hints of friends, and the animadversions of critics, have been carefully adopted and almost every article has been corrected and improved." He added: "In answer to those gentlemen who have objected to the smallness of the print, and have recommended a larger type, the author begs leave to observe, that it has been found impracticable to remove the inconvenience ... and it must be remembered, that the book is intended as a volume of occasional reference, and, therefore, that it cannot long fatigue the eye." The contract between Lempriere and his publisher Cadell calls for an edition of 5,000 copies, with the profit to be shared equally between author and publisher.<sup>4</sup>

Also in 1792, Lempriere had been appointed headmaster at the famous Abingdon School serving in addition as the curate of Radley. He also was now a married man with a family soon on the way. It appears that "once Lempriere had settled down in Abingdon he seemed to lose most of his creative energy, and it is to be feared that he relaxed into the life of contemplative leisure which was all too common among the divines in the eighteenth century."<sup>5</sup> Subsequent editions of the dictionary appeared in 1797,<sup>6</sup> 1801, and 1804, but "little attempt was made to correct errors or to supply omissions."<sup>7</sup> By this time the reputation of the book was solidly established. Two, undoubtedly pirated editions, were printed in Dublin in 1792 and 1793, while a French edition edited by A. N. M. Christophe, appeared in Paris in 1805.

Lempriere formally dedicated the sixth edition in 1806 to Richard Valpy. In asking permission he wrote "I am afraid you may say Why so late, but to tell you the truth in the first edition, I never thought of a dedication for a book which ... was the work of an inexperienced youth trembling for the fate of his lubrications which he fairly considered unworthy."<sup>8</sup> Encouraged by his success, Lempriere subsequently produced in 1808 a one-volume *Universal Biography*, which, however, did not meet with the same public success.

### Lempriere in America

It was this sixth edition that found its way into print in America for the first time in 1809. It was printed by the New York firm of D. & G. Bruce for a consortium of New York booksellers, consisting of Samuel Campbell, William Falconer, T. & J. Swords, Ezra Sargeant, Peter Mesier, Evert Duyckinck, Inskeep & Bradford, M. & W. Ward, Robert McDermut, Williams & Whiting, Thomas Ronalds, Stephen Stephens, John Tiebout, and Samuel Wood. All of these were founding members of the New-York Association of Booksellers which was organized in the same year.<sup>9</sup> The Association was established in order to promote cooperation among the booksellers and to avoid duplication of effort in issuing new titles. Other titles produced by the consortium in its first year were John Mair's *Latin and English Dictionary* as well as Charles Hutton's *Arithmetic*.

There were similar bookseller organizations in Boston, Philadelphia, and Baltimore, and the competition for titles and markets was substantial. A national organization, The American Company of Booksellers had been established in 1802 on the initiative of Mathew Carey of Philadelphia, Isaiah Thomas of Worcester, Massachusetts and Hugh Gaine of New York, the nation's leading publishers and booksellers at the time. But after a few years of organizing book fairs, the activities were suspended and competition rather than cooperation became the norm.

Much of the American book trade after 1783 had consisted of selling imported English, Scottish, and Irish editions of standard texts for schools and the general reading public. But after 1793, European warfare and the resulting Atlantic shipping constraints, made it more profitable to reprint these texts in the United States for local and regional distribution. A rapidly increasing population, improved printing presses, and paper mills accelerated this trend. International copyright did not exist and there was considerable competition for popular and profitable British titles among the booksellers along the Atlantic coast. Through an elaborate system of exchanges in an American economy still largely based on barter, booksellers developed and maintained their inventories.

The New York booksellers were more occupied with wholesale than retail activities. Their stock mainly consisted of bibles in various sizes, religious tracts and texts, school books and popular reading material, as well as a large variety of paper products. Using the many available waterways, the New York market for all

kind of commodities reached into New Jersey, upstate New York, Connecticut, Western Massachusetts, and segments of the Atlantic seaboard, for which they competed with Boston, Philadelphia, Baltimore, and Charleston. Country merchants would exchange agricultural products in the New York market for industrial goods, including books. The international import and export trade with Europe and the Caribbean completed the circle.

Thus began the American life of Lempriere's *Dictionary*. The first New York edition of 1809 sold out slowly. It was not until 1816 that a new edition appeared. Reprinting the eighth London edition of 1812, the New York printers T. & W. Mercein produced the second American edition on behalf of New York booksellers Andrew T. Goodrich and William B. Gilley. A third American edition came from the press of J. Crissy in Philadelphia in 1822.

### **From British Reprints to Revised American Editions**

But if the absence of international copyright allowed for free reprinting of British texts in America, American copyright was used to protect some of these. The American Copyright Act had been passed by Congress in 1790, after a long campaign by prominent American authors, notably Noah Webster who had a considerable stake in protecting his *Speller* and *Grammar* and later his *Dictionary* from pirated editions. The technique used by American publishers was to claim that the British version of the book was edited by an American author, which then made it eligible for copyright protection. While in some cases, the changes were more cosmetic than substantial, the process increasingly allowed American knowledge and information to become available to the American reading public.

One of the earliest publishers to take advantage of this was Thomas Dobson of Philadelphia. Dobson had been born and trained in Scotland and had set up his American bookselling and printing business in 1785. In 1795 he printed an edition of Edinburgh physician William Buchan's standard text *Domestic Medicine* "revised and adapted to the diseases and climate of the United States of America by Samuel Powel Griffitts MD, Professor of Materia Medica in the University of Pennsylvania." The emergence of American science was also demonstrated in several other edited reprints of text books. The earlier mentioned New York 1809 edition of Charles Hutton's *Complete Treatise on Practical Arithmetic*, was actually "corrected, enlarged and adapted to the use of schools and

the men of business" by New York teacher D. P. Adams. Adams also edited a "corrected, newly arranged and greatly enlarged edition" of Robert Gibson's *Treatise on Practical Surveying*, first published in London in 1752. Actually, there had been earlier competing New York and Philadelphia editions "with alterations and amendments, adapted to the use of American surveyors."<sup>10</sup> In 1821, New York bookseller Evert Duyckinck issued a new edition of Gibson's book, still using the same plates from the 1798 edition, but now edited and adapted by James Ryan, the author of *An Elementary Treatise on Algebra*. Charles Hutton's famous *Course of Mathematics* which had been completed in a London edition in three volumes in 1811, was brought to market by a New York consortium in 1812. It was edited by Robert Adrain, Professor of Mathematics at Queen's College in New Brunswick, New Jersey, until its academic programs were suspended in 1816.<sup>11</sup> In the preface the publishers appeal to American military schools to adopt this new American edition as an act of patriotism, an issue easily understood in the time of war with Great Britain. Adrain, in his introduction, carefully identified the many changes he had made for the American usage. The book stayed in print for an extended period of time, and in 1822 Adrain edited the third American edition for Evert Duyckinck. Added to the text was an "Elementary essay on descriptive geometry" an original piece by Adrain, who now taught at Columbia College. It turned out to be a major addition to the mathematical literature. "What he did accomplish entitles him to the glory of a pioneer in the development of American mathematics."<sup>12</sup>

In similar fashion, Benjamin Silliman (1779–1864), a Yale professor, who would become the founding editor in 1818 of the famous and long-lasting periodical *American Journal of Science*, attached his "Notes of various subjects" to the Boston 1810 reprint of William Henry's *Elements of Experimental Chemistry*. Silliman made the changes to suit his own teaching needs of the subject.<sup>13</sup> He also appended a syllabus of his geological lectures at Yale to the first American edition of Robert Blakewell's *Introduction to Geology* (1829) and added even more to the second edition in 1833.<sup>14</sup>

New York physician Samuel Latham Mitchill (1775–1828) and editor of *The Medical Repository* (New York 1797–1824), added his "Observations on the geology of North America" to the New York 1818 edition of Georges Cuvier's *Essays on the Theory of the Earth*. It was considered Mitchill's most extensive work of geological character.<sup>15</sup> Mitchill had earlier edited an edition of Erasmus

Darwin's *Zoonomia, or, the Laws of Organic Life* to which he added an important introduction. It had been printed by New York printers T. & J. Swords, "printers for the Faculty of Physic of Columbia College." Mitchill also edited an edition of William Phillips *Elementary Introduction to the Knowledge of Mineralogy* in 1818, with "notes and additions to American articles."

There were several more examples of the use of British texts as vessels for publishing new American science. Robert Patterson "revised and corrected" the text of James Ferguson *Astronomy Explained upon Sir Isaac Newton's Principles* in its first American edition of 1806. William James MacNeven, professor at the New York College of Physicians and Surgeons, who had earlier published his *Exposition of the Atomic Theory of Chemistry* (1819), edited "with notes and amendations" the 1821 New York edition of William Thomas Brande, *A Manual of Chemistry*. Samuel Mitchill's brother-in-law, the New York physician Samuel Akerly, professor at the New York Mechanic and Scientific Institution "considerably enlarged" the fourth American edition of Robert Hooper's *Lexicon Medicum* for the Harper Brothers in 1826. Harper would keep that edition in print until 1874!

Other means of introducing American knowledge to Americans were revised and updated editions of British encyclopedias. Thomas Dobson of Philadelphia considerably added to this process with his ambitious edition of the *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, published in eighteen volumes between 1789 and 1803. His version, the *Encyclopaedia or a Dictionary of Arts, Sciences and Miscellaneous Literature*, included important American contributions from geographer Jedidiah Morse, mathematician David Rittenhouse, as well as from Samuel Miller, James Hardie, and David Hosack.<sup>16</sup> Another example was the *New and Complete American Encyclopaedia*, edited and printed by Scottish born and educated John Low of New York in seven volumes between 1805 and 1811. It was based on the *Encyclopaedia Perthensis*, published in Perth by C. Miller and edited by Alexander Aitchison between 1796 and 1806. Then there was Philadelphia's Samuel Bradford's edition of Samuel Rees, *The Cyclopaedia or Universal Dictionary of Arts, Science and Literature*, a monumental and finely illustrated work, printed in forty-one volumes between 1810 and 1824, which bankrupted Bradford in the process. It was advertised the "first American edition, revised, corrected, enlarged, and adapted to this country by several literary and scientific characters." The *Encyclopaedia Americana*, translated

and edited from the German after the seventh edition of the famous Brockhaus *Conversations Lexicon* by a team of American scholars and scientists under the leadership of Francis Lieber. It was published between 1829 and 1832 by Carey and Lee of Philadelphia in ten volumes. As noted, all of these encyclopedias had substantial additions and changes pertaining to American subjects.

### **Charles Anthon and Lempriere's Dictionary**

The fifth American edition of Lempriere's *Dictionary* appeared in New York in 1825.<sup>17</sup> It was printed by William E. Dean of 36 Stone Street for Evert Duyckinck, George Long, William B. Gilley, Collins & Co., and Collins & Hannay, all prominent New York booksellers. This new edition was, in now common terminology, "corrected and improved" by Charles Anthon, "Adjunct Professor of Languages and Ancient Geography in Columbia College, New-York."

Charles Anthon (1797–1867) was born in New York City on November 19, 1797, the son of George Christian Anthon, a German physician who had served in the British Army in America and a French mother. Charles was a brilliant student and graduated from Columbia College in 1815, "having won so many prizes and awards that, in fairness to other students, his name was withdrawn from competition for graduation honors."<sup>18</sup> He worked for a while in the law office of his older brother John and was actually admitted to the bar in 1819, but he never practiced law. In 1820 he was appointed adjunct professor of Greek and Latin at Columbia and never left that institution.

When he was approached to prepare a new edition of Lempriere in 1825, "he hinted the propriety of making some alterations in the text. The answer received from a certain quarter was, that one might as well think of making alterations in the Scriptures as in the pages of Dr. Lempriere! and that all an editor had to do was merely to revise the references contained in the English work."<sup>19</sup>

In his preface to the new Lempriere edition addressed to his brother John, "his best advisor and friend," Charles Anthon acknowledges the almost iconic status that Lempriere's *Dictionary* had acquired after twelve British<sup>20</sup> and four American editions. Yet, after



A closer examination of the volume, I soon became convinced that it was a strange medley of valuable materials and miserable trash, of correct information and careless conjecture, and, what was far worse, that the precept of the Roman Satyrist, which no instructor of youth should for a moment lose sight of, was violated on almost every page. There seemed, indeed, to be a strange pruriency on the part of the author, and one totally irreconcilable with his sacred profession, to bring forward on many occasions what should have remained covered with the mantle of oblivion.

After elaborating on his changes and the specific sources he has used to justify them, Anthon closes: "In the remarks which I have made respecting the work of Dr. Lempriere I have been actuated solely by a sense of duty, not by any wish to deprive his memory<sup>21</sup> of the honours which have been conferred upon in."

Interestingly enough, the same printer and publishers, also issued in the same year a new fifth American edition of *Elements of Greek Grammar*, written originally by Lempriere's teacher and mentor Richard Valpy and published in 1805. It was "arranged on an improved plan, with extensive additions," also by Charles Anthon.

The printer and copyright holder of both these books was William E. Dean (1788–1879). Dean had been apprenticed to New York printer and bookseller George Long in 1811 and opened his own print shop in 1815.<sup>22</sup> It was not until 1823, however, that we find Dean's name on any title page of a printed book. In that year he printed for Evert Duyckinck, George Long, and Collins & Hannay an edition of Alexander Adam's *Roman Antiquities*, edited by Peter Wilson, Professor of Languages at Columbia. It was followed in 1824 with the printing of an eight-volume set of Charles Rollin, *Ancient History* for the same principals as well as a small volume of essays called *Grecian Wreath of Victory* by several New York luminaries, such as Clement Moore and Governor Clinton DeWitt and, indeed, young Charles Anthon.

For several years, Dean worked very closely with Duyckinck and Long, who was closing down his long-time printing activities at the time. Long had been trained in the classics in England and came to New York, after a stint in the British army in Quebec, in 1802 and began his own business in 1809. He soon became the pre-eminent printer of Greek and Latin in New York and had a thriving

business as a wholesale bookseller as well. His brother-in-law Evert Duyckinck (1764–1833) had started as a New York bookseller in 1793 and was by this time one of the most productive and respected among his many New York colleagues and competitors, but also slowing down. His support for Dean was by no means unusual. Throughout his career he had assisted newcomers in the book business, including giving the Harper brothers their first print order in 1817.

For some time after 1825, William Dean was much involved as a printer of classical texts, especially using the by now well-established techniques of stereotyping for keeping editions in print for a long time. The cooperation of printers and booksellers was based on a guaranteed number of copies each would take of a newly planned edition, thus distributing the financial risks involved. Duyckinck, for instance, bought 250 copies of the earlier mentioned edition of Adams' *Roman Antiquities*. He sold them to his bookselling customers in the northeastern cities and along the eastern seaboard. On other occasions, the publisher took the whole risk. The third edition of Bonnycastle's *Introduction to Algebra* (1827) was printed by Dean in an edition of 3,000 copies, all on Duyckinck's account.<sup>23</sup> He immediately sold 2,000 of them to Duyckinck's former apprentice and employee Orville A. Roorbach (1803–1861), whom he had helped set up in business for himself shortly before.<sup>24</sup>

Anthon's 1825 edition of Lempriere sold out quickly and was met with good public response, according to his introduction of the sixth American edition in 1827. It was once again printed by Dean under the same copyright, but the group of sponsoring booksellers had changed somewhat. While Duyckinck was still the lead publisher, George Long no longer directly participated. Added to the list were Orville Roorbach and the New York retail booksellers, G. & C. Carvill. The book had grown again from 804 to 890 pages. Anthon boasts in the introduction that the number of additions to the work now had risen to four thousand. He acknowledges that he had inserted, wherever applicable, "new and interesting theories of the day." Writing in the third person as the author, he adds: "He has taken the liberty also of occasionally intruding theories of his own."

After this publication Anthon continued to edit classical texts, including an edition of Sallust for the Carvill brothers in 1829 and the fourth American edition of Valpy in 1830. But he also took time out for his own research. In 1830 he published, once again with the

Carvill brothers, who were rapidly becoming the leading scholarly publishers and booksellers in New York, a critical Latin edition of Horace's *Poems*. It was an enormous enterprise. The book was over a thousand pages and composed in the best of the European tradition. However, it neither did meet the critical reception he had hoped for, nor was it much of a commercial success. Apparently, the American market was not ready yet for primary scholarship. Anthon did follow up with an edited version of Horace's *Works* and also continued to work on a new edition of Lempriere.

### The War of New Editions

Anthon was slowly working on his third American edition of the dictionary, while he was writing and editing his other books. But William Dean wouldn't wait. The 1827 sixth edition had sold out and he was anxious to follow up, but apparently Anthon was not ready yet. As the owner of the copyright Dean decided to go his own way and hired a new set of editors for the seventh edition. Thus, under the old title *Bibliotheca Classica*, this edition was revised and corrected by Lorenzo L. Da Ponte and John Ogilvy. Da Ponte (1805–1851) was the American-born oldest son of Lorenzo da Ponte, (1763–1833), the Italian librettist of Leopold von Gluck, Antonio Salieri, and Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart, who had come to America in 1805. Da Ponte Jr., whose specialty was Greek, became professor at the newly founded New York University in 1832.<sup>25</sup> The Reverend John David Ogilby (1810–1851), his co-editor, a Columbia graduate and Episcopal minister was on the faculty of Rutgers College in New Brunswick.

The new editors acknowledged somewhat grudgingly Anthon's previous work, but decided to base their edition on the criticisms leveled to Lempriere's original work in an article in the (British) *Quarterly Journal of Education* in 1831. According to their introduction they were all set to assemble the proper sources from Europe and begin the elaborate editing process when the publisher "required them to begin; and the demand of the market, they were informed, was of so urgent a character, that unless the work could appear within a limited time, it was considered as of no avail to prepare it." They were given three months to do the work and, obviously despite their good efforts, the changes were somewhat superficial.

The lack of scholarly library facilities in New York is worthwhile noting here. While there were libraries open to the

public, the New York Society Library, established in 1754 and reopened in 1784 after the war, was the most extensive. There was also the New York Mechanics Library, founded in 1821 and several circulating libraries operated by local booksellers. But most of these catered to the reading interests of the general public. Even the Columbia College library was completely inadequate for research purposes. Private collections were the most important source of information, and Charles Anthon's collection, as we will see, was already one of the most extensive ones on the new continent.

Competition for Lempriere editions was indeed underway. An abbreviated stereotyped edition "for schools and academies" came off the press of Boston printers Lyman Thurston & Co in 1832. Copyright belonged to Samuel G. Goodrich. It was picked up for local New York distribution by Pendleton & Hill on Broadway. They were minor players in the New York book trade, but nevertheless the edition, which was undoubtedly priced lower, was a threat to the market. Moreover, Dean knew that Anthon was working on a new edition. He put his edition on the market, secured the market support of several of the major New York wholesalers, notably Collins, Keese & Co, N. & J. White and Roe Lockwood. Dean marketed his edition with a vengeance. New stereotyped editions came to market in 1833 and 1834. The tenth edition of 1836 was "greatly enlarged in the historical department by Lorenzo L. da Ponte," but afterwards the editions remained unchanged.

Charles Anthon now signed a new contract with G. & C. & H. Carvill, with whom he had many dealings already. The Carvills took out the new copyright and produced the Anthon's third edition in 1833. The co-publisher was Henry C. Sleight, who was also the printer. Once again, Anthon's effort added substantively to the new edition. It had now grown twice in size! For obvious practical reasons it was produced in two volumes. Anthon acknowledges the assistance he received from a former student, Abraham B. Conger in re-calculating the tables of weight and measures. Anthon included in this edition a "List of works, excluding the classics, forming part of the editor's private collection, and which have been consulted for the purposes of the present edition." It is an early and impressive view of Anthon's personal library.

In the midst of all these editorial labors, Anthon did not neglect his teaching duties. One of Anthon's young protégées at Columbia was Evert Augustus Duyckinck, oldest son of the respected New York bookseller and publisher. Duyckinck senior, now retired from the book business and actively building his private

library, proudly paid Anthon in 1831 for “two quarters schooling” at the Columbia College Grammar School.<sup>26</sup> Duyckinck junior (1816–1868) and his younger brother George Long Duyckinck (1823–1863), became influential American literary editors.

### Back in England

In the introduction to this new edition, Anthon also mentions the “very flattering reception which had been extended to his labours by some of the first scholars in England, and the circumstance of the work’s having been adopted in many of the classical seminaries of that country.” What he really meant to refer to was a British edition of Lempriere published in 1828, edited by Henry Edmund Barker (1788–1839), which was based on Lempriere’s third edition of 1797 and Anthon’s corrections to the 1827 seventh American edition. Barker, a Cambridge trained classical scholar, was a prolific writer, editor, and lexicographer. In addition to his work on Lempriere, he edited various classical authors as well as a British edition of Charles Webster’s *Dictionary*.<sup>27</sup>

Barker edited new Lempriere editions with similar corrections in 1832 and in 1838. Anthon and Barker had an extensive correspondence about the various changes, which has been preserved at Columbia University. In 1837 Barker compiled a collection of supplements to the many editions of Lempriere, including those by Anthon.<sup>28</sup> Barker died in 1839, but a fourth edition, edited by J. A. Giles (1808–1884), was published in 1843. Meanwhile, London publisher William Tegg entered the Lempriere battle with a yet another version, now edited by William Park in 1838. It was reprinted often at least until 1852.

Lempriere’s original publisher, now operating as Cadell and Davies, also had not been idle. Reprints came off their press regularly. In each case Lempriere shared equally in the profits and was compensated for corrections and revisions.<sup>29</sup> A tenth edition appeared in 1818 and was promptly stereotyped, which allowed for unchanged subsequent editions. After Lempriere’s death in 1824, the publishers continued issuing reprints. A fifteenth edition followed in 1829; the nineteenth appeared in 1839. No further revisions were included in any one of these. A curious advertisement appeared in the London papers apparently sometime after Lempriere’s death. In it, a new edition edited by Lempriere’s oldest son, Francis D. Lempriere, MA was announced.<sup>30</sup> However, the book remains a bibliographical ghost as no copies have been found.<sup>31</sup>

But the role of Lempriere's *Dictionary* proved far from over. Several abbreviated editions remained very popular in the schools. In 1853, William Dean was still issuing his stereotyped fifteenth edition. When he retired in 1855 he sold his plates to Lippincott in Philadelphia, which continued to reprint this edition, at least until 1888.<sup>32</sup> In England, the 1829 Cadell edition was regularly reprinted until 1879, when Routledge of London took over the rights. It has not been out of print since; two-hundred-fifteen years after its first edition!

### **Anthon's Dictionary**

Anthon truly had acquired the editorial taste and decided to make the best of it, contracting with the Harper brothers.

On October 3 (1835) he signed a sixty-four-word agreement, which was one of the shortest and most profitable contracts that any author ever signed with the brothers. He agreed to edit a series of "Classical and Auxiliary Works" for use in schools and colleges, all books to be stereotyped and printed at Harper's expense. On the thirty-five books, averaging about one a year, that were thus to be published and to be accounted for on the half-profits basis from 1836 to 1867, Charles Anthon was to earn \$100,000, a cool half-million dollars in today's currency.<sup>33</sup>

Ultimately, there were almost fifty books in this textbook series, including editions of Homer, Xenophon, Terence, Cicero, Caesar, Sallust, Virgil, Horace, Livy, Ovid, Tacitus, and Juvenal.

Meanwhile, his Lempriere edition, after several reprints, was once again out of print and a "new one was demanded; when the copy-right of the work passed from the Messrs. Carvill to the Harper Brothers. They wished a Classical Dictionary in as complete and useful a form as it could possibly be made."<sup>34</sup>

But Anthon had made up his mind. He would not edit yet another edition of Lempriere.

The republication of this latter edition in England, and the implied confession with such a step, that the original work of Lempriere stood in need of improvement, now broke the charm which had fettered the judgments of so many of our own countrymen, and it began to be conceded on all sides

that the *Classical Dictionary* of Dr. Lempriere was by no means entitled to the claim of infallibility; nay, indeed, that it was defective throughout.<sup>35</sup>

A new work was called for and Anthon set out to work. Harper had acquired the stereotype plates from Carvill for \$4,500, and the decision was made to destroy them, although still in good condition, presumably to get the book off the market altogether.<sup>36</sup>

In the summer of 1841, Anthon's new *Classical Dictionary* came off the press. It was a handsome royal octavo volume, printed in two columns, and containing some 1400 pages. Once again, the book is dedicated to his brother John "who, amid the duties of a laborious profession, can still find leisure for holding converse with the pages of antiquity, and in whom legal erudition is so happily blended with the lighter graces of ancient and modern literature." Anthon refers in his introduction also to the editorial help he received from one of his former Columbia students, Henry Drisler.

The book was an instant success in the marketplace. The Harpers by this time had created a national market for their books. New editions followed quickly. A fourth edition came out already in 1843, which now had a fifty-page supplement, as well as Anthon's response to criticisms. Although the dictionary was extraordinary well received in the general and scholarly press, there were exceptions—especially the *North American Review*, published in Hartford, which led the attack.<sup>37</sup> It included suggestions that Anthon had not properly cited articles he had taken from the *Encyclopaedia of Useful Knowledge*. However, a little careful reading between the lines of its critiques of Anthon's works suggests that the *North American Review* was motivated as much by regional prejudice and rivalry as by genuine concern for the future of classical studies in America. In its review of his edition of Jacob's *Greek Reader*, Anthon's volume is consistently referred to as the "New York edition," which is judged woefully inferior to the Boston edition of 1832. This hostility toward New York publications and New York publishers is evident elsewhere in the *North American Review's* judgments on Anthon, and reflects an unfortunate rivalry which existed in the early nineteenth century between classicists in New England and those on other parts of the country that did little to advance the cause of classics in the young Republic.<sup>38</sup> Edgar Allan Poe had similar perspectives. He praised Anthon's work. "His critical thrusts were on Anthon's behalf against the 'clique of pedants in

and about Boston" who had accused Anthon of plagiarism, "the most preposterous accusation in the world."<sup>39</sup>

The American world of classical scholarship had indeed changed significantly by this time. A new generation of American scholars—notably George Ticknor (1791–1871), Edward Everett (1794–1865), and George Bancroft (1800–1891)—had all studied in Göttingen before returning to Harvard in one capacity or another. German scholarship had replaced the British model for the new Americans. Anthon's Latin equivalent at Harvard from 1832 until 1851 was the German born and trained Carl Beck (1798–1866). He was followed there by his brilliant student George Martin Lane (1823–1897), who also had spent several years at Göttingen. Lane held the Harvard chair from 1851 until 1894. At Yale, the Latin chair was held from 1831 until 1852 by James Luce Kingsley (1778–1852), while the Greek chair there was held by Dwight Woolsey (1801–1889). All of these scholars produced several new and annotated editions of classical authors, thus directly competing with Anthon's prodigious output. Anthon's colleague and successor at Columbia for over fifty years, was his former student and collaborator Henry Drisler (1818–1897). Drisler also wrote an extensive eulogy for Charles Anthon, in which he defended his mentor's place in American classical scholarship.<sup>40</sup>

Anthon's dictionary, in its stereotyped fourth edition of 1843, remained in print unchanged for another fifty years. It was replaced in 1894 by *Harper's Dictionary of Classical Literature and Antiquities*, edited by Harry Thurston Peck (1865–1914). This edition remained a standard work for another half-century until 1947, when the *Oxford Classical Dictionary* effectively replaced it. Anthon continued his distinguished teaching career at Columbia and remained a prodigious editor of classical texts for schools and colleges. He published a new volume about every year. After his death in 1867, Anthon's great scholarly library of 7,000 volumes was bought by Cornell University, where it joined the collection of the German philologist Franz Bopp, thus forming a cornerstone of one of the nation's finest classical collections.

### New Wine in New Bottles

"Neither do men put new wine into old bottles: else the bottles break, and the wine runneth out and the bottles perish: but they put new wine into new bottles, and both are preserved."<sup>41</sup> British textbooks had served their purpose in the transition of



American scholarship from being an adjunct to an independent force. By the middle of the nineteenth century, American science and scholarship had been well established and it was served by a professional publishing establishment with strong national and international connections in Boston, New York, Philadelphia, and other major cities.

### NOTES

1. Lawrence Norfolk, *Lempriere's Dictionary* (London: Sinclair-Stevenson, 1991).
2. Burton Feldman, Introduction to John Lempriere, *Bibliotheca Classica*. ed. 1788. Reprint, (New York: Garland Press, 1984). Douglas Bush, *Mythology and the Romantic Tradition in English Poetry*. (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press), 1937.
3. a.l.s John Lempriere to Thomas Cadell, undated, Historical Society of Pennsylvania.
4. Contract, August 7, 1792. Adelman Collection, Bryn Mawr College Library. For other aspects of the business practices of Cadell and Davies see at length: Theodore Besterman, *The Publishing Firm of Cadell & Davies. Selected Correspondence and Accounts, 1793-1836* (London: Oxford University Press), 1938.
5. F. A. Wright, "A Memoir of the Rev. John Lempriere" in Lempriere, *Classical Dictionary*, 3rd ed., London, Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1984.
6. In the preface to third edition of 1797, Lempriere refers to a Latin translation of his dictionary printed by Leemhorst in Deventer (The Netherlands) in 1794. Apparently the editor, after having severely criticized Lempriere's first edition, translated it complete with errors that had already been corrected by Lempriere in his second edition of 1792.
7. Wright, "A Memoir of the Rev. John Lempriere."
8. a.l.s. Lempriere to Valpy, Abingdon, July 18, 1806. The Adelman Collection. Bryn Mawr College.
9. Constitution of the New-York Association of Booksellers, Adopted February 11th, 1809. New York, George Long, 1809.
10. Philadelphia, Joseph Cruikshank, 1792 and later editions. New York, William A. Davis & Co for a consortium of New York booksellers in 1798.

11. The college reopened in 1825 under a new name, Rutgers College, named after New York philanthropist Colonel Henry Rutgers. Adrain returned to the College in the same year.
12. Julian L. Coolidge, "Robert Adrain and the Beginnings of American Mathematics," *American Mathematical Monthly* 33 (1926), 75–92.
13. John F. Fulton and Elizabeth H. Thomson, *Benjamin Silliman, Pathfinder in American Science* (New York: Henry Schuman, 1947), 75.
14. *Ibid.*, 136.
15. Courtney Robert Hall, *A Scientist in the Early Republic. Samuel Latham Mitchill, 1764–1831* (New York, Columbia Univ. Press, 1934), 142.
16. Robert D. Arner, *Dobson's Encyclopaedia. The Publisher, Text and Publication of America's First Britannica, 1789–1803* (Philadelphia, PA.: Univ. of Pennsylvania Press, 1991). Judy L. Larson, "Dobson's Encyclopaedia. A precedent in American engraving," in Gerald W. R. Ward (ed) *The American Illustrated Book in the Nineteenth Century* (Charlottesville, VA: The Univ. Press of Virginia, 1987).
17. If a fourth American edition was ever published, we have found no trace of it. Perhaps it was announced and not pursued, or, the publishers had lost count.
18. Stephen Newmyer, "Charles Anthon: Knickerbocker Scholar," *Classical Outlook*, 59 (1981–82), 41–44.
19. Charles Anthon, Preface to *A Classical Dictionary*, 4th ed. (New York: Harper, 1842), 1842.
20. The twelfth British edition had been published in London in 1823, and we may assume that Anthon used it for his revisions.
21. Lempriere had died a year before this was written, in 1824.
22. Dean worked side-by-side in 1815 in Long's print shop with later Albany newspaperman and political boss Thurlow Weed. Both were members of the New York Typographical Society.
23. Duyckinck Day Books. New York Public Library. The volume for 1825 no longer exists and we have, therefore no, sales records of Lempriere.
24. Roorbach, through his *Catalog of American Publications* (1820–1862) would become America's first and foremost bibliographer.
25. Lorenzo da Ponte, *Memoirs* (Philadelphia, PA: Lippincott, 1929), 430.
26. Duyckinck Day Books. New York Public Library.

27. *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, 11th ed. vol. 3 (Cambridge University Press, 1911), 403.
28. E. H. Barker, *A Collection of Supplements to All Editions of Lempriere's Dictionary, More Especially to the Enlarged one of Professor Anthon...* (London: A. J. Valpy, 1837).
29. Correspondence between Lempriere and Cadell, Adelman Collection, Bryn Mawr College Library. Other examples in Besterman, *Publishing Firm*.
30. Wright, "A Memoir of the Rev. John Lempriere."
31. S. Austin Allibone, *Critical Dictionary of English Literature*. Philadelphia, Lippincott, 1858 cites the edition as published in 1825.
32. Obituary *New York Times*, June 17, 1879.
33. Eugene Exman, *The Brothers Harper. A Unique Publishing Partnership and Its Impact on the Cultural Life of America from 1817 to 1853* (New York: Harper & Rowe, 1965). 68.
34. Anthon in his Introduction to his *Classical Dictionary* (New York, Harper, 1841).
35. Ibid.
36. Exman, *Brothers Harper*, 150.
37. *North American Review*, 44 (1842), 175–198.
38. Newmyer, "Charles Anthon," 43.
39. Exman, *Brothers Harper*, 149–150.
40. Henry Drisler, *Charles Anthon, LL.D., Late Jay-professor of the Greek Language and Literature in Columbia College. A Commemorative Discourse, Prepared and Delivered at the Request of the Trustees and Alumni of the College* (New York: Van Nostrand, 1868).
41. Matthew IX, 17, c. 75. Quoted in H. L. Mencken, *A New Dictionary of Quotations on Historical Principles from Ancient and Modern Sources* (New York, Knopf, 1942), 122.